

Minute taker: Noel Kelly

Time: 9:30-11:00AM

SIPRI Armament and Disarmament Cluster Meeting

Solna, 15 January 2020

Participants:

Sibylle Bauer, Ekaterina klimenko, Pieter Wezman, Siemon Wezeman, Nan Tian, Diego Lopes, Alexandra Kuimova, Vincent Boulanin, Mark Bromley, Giovanna Maletta, Shannon Kile, Tytti Erästö, Petr Topychkanov, Tarja Cronberg, John Batho, Lena Kappelin, Emma Zetterström

Agenda circulated for A&D cluster meeting 15 January 2020:

- Update from Programmes
- Open call from Carnegie Corporation New York (project ideas?)
- Funding applications (A&D funding applications Excel will be sent in advance of our meeting)
- Publication and outreach updates (Joey/John/Alex)
- Updates from other Clusters (Katja/Martina)
- Update from Sibylle (SMT discussions, UD grant: report on 2019 and planning for 2020)
- NIS visit to SIPRI on 21 January
- Stockholm Security Conference 2020
- SIPRI Travel Policy
- 2020 Away Day (we will discuss this at the Cluster meeting)
- Cluster-wiki 2020

Emerging Military and Security Technologies – report

- **Current Project Activities**

The Project are in the process of finalising several reports at the same time. The first is a report that is a part of the Carnegie project titled '*Mapping the Impact of Machine Learning and Autonomy on Strategic Stability and Nuclear Risk*' with a deadline for editorial on 28 January.

The second report referenced is for a project titled '*Limits on Autonomy in Weapon Systems: Identifying Concrete Elements of Human Control*' and being co-written ICRC (The International Committee of the Red Cross). This paper is being finalised for a parallel internal review at SIPRI and ICRC and an external review at the same time. A draft deadline is set for the 7 February. In addition, in co-operation with the Communications team work on a series of short films for this project are well under preparation.

A report for a project titled 'Cyberspace: Crisis prevention and Management' is being done with MSB about the escalation of cyber incidents is being finalised involving work mainly for the last round of editing.

Work on a new and short project titled '*Latest Development of the Cyber Insecurity in Europe*' funded by the Japan Bank for International Cooperation is currently in process. This project started at the end of November 2019 and runs until end of February 2020. This project will also involve a workshop here in SIPRI on 4 February.

- **Fundraising Activities**

The Project have received positive indications that funding will be given for a second phase of the project titled 'Limits on Autonomy in Weapon Systems: Identifying Concrete Elements of Human Control'. As a result the team are planning for a workshop in June here in SIPRI. As the focus of this project will be IHL – SIPRI will recruit an Associate Fellow.

- **Travel**

Current travels are up to date in the Clusterwiki calendar with Vincent referencing his forthcoming trip to Oxford University for a workshop on 'Artificial intelligence and International Stability'. Vincent will present a paper on 'Mitigating the risks that artificial intelligence poses to international stability'. See clusterwiki calendar for further information.

Dual-use and Arms trade Control

- **Current Project Activities**

This is a period for working on the SIPRI Yearbook DUAT chapter time and this is being done and due to the Editors during week 4. Kolja is working on a paper for FRS (Fondation pour la recherche stratégique) on the topic of the HCOC (Hague Code of Conduct).

- **Fundraising Activities**

There are currently ongoing discussions and applications with the German MFA by DUAT who are seeking funding for work on end-use controls and are waiting to hear back. The German MFA have also expressed a strong interest in funding some of the DUAT work in the relation to the ATT. If the applications are successful then work would start in the Spring and continue until early April 2021. Giovanna had taken the lead in drafting a proposal for the UD strategic grant examining how development assistance (ODA) spending have been used to fund SALW control-related activities in Sub-Saharan Africa. Kolja had put together a varied proposal for work on export controls and AI which would potentially be part of the project DUAT are trying to get funding for from the German MFA.

- **Travel**

Kolja and Mark were at the EU Export Control Forum in Brussels during December and details are in the wiki. Mark chaired a session on emerging technologies that was useful for meeting some good and new contacts. It was noted the US sent quite a large delegation this time and they were emphasizing to the Europeans the need to have stronger export controls to China.

During the 8-15 January Kolja was in Italy attending the ISODARCO (International School on Disarmament and Research on Conflicts) winter school where subject examined was: *Emerging Technologies, Evolving Nuclear Postures, and Deteriorating Norms: is the Global Nuclear Order Eroding?*

Giovanna is due to travel to the Philippines during the last week of January (27-31 January) to participate in two activities part of the second phase of the P2P ATT Outreach Project (implemented by Expertise France and the German Federal Office of Economics and Export Control (BAFA)). See clusters-wiki calendar for further information on DUAT trips.

- **Publications**

The EXBS grant funded papers that Mark and Sibylle wrote on investigations and prosecutions of export control violations and Kolja wrote on inter-regime dialogues came out in December 2019. These were the last two substantive deliverables for the EXBS grant. The feedback for these publications was good and Sibylle will be in Brussels during week 4 (22 January) and present the paper on investigations and prosecutions of export control violations to the EU Council Working Party on Dual-use.

- **AOB**

For intra-cluster interest the point was raised that DUAT team are receiving invitations to do work under the ATT Outreach activities. Invitations have been received recently for event in Belarus by Kolja to work mainly on dual-use export control and to speak about emerging technologies and for Giovanna to travel to Guyana during mid-February. The DUAT research team currently have a lot of obligations and if others are interested to know more about these invitations or going to these events then contact the DUAT team. It was flagged that following discussions on the UD strategic grant DUAT have given thought to inter-cluster cooperation and in particular with the Peace Operations and conflict management project. As a result they drafted some ideas and

have sent to them. The project could possibly be about the new Peace Facility that the EU is planning to fund via an off-budget mechanism. This mechanism foresees – *inter alia* – possible transfers of military equipment to EU military missions on the ground. The proposed concept is still in development and DUAT will check the text with Jair first and loop in others if necessary.

Nuclear disarmament, arms control and non-proliferation – report

- **Current Project Activities**

The project proposal for '*Assessing Nuclear Deterrence Risks and Challenges in South Asia*' was approved by the German MFA. Petr will be the principle in-house lead on this project and Associate Senior Fellow Dr Lora Saalman will also be working on this project. The project has two main research tasks. The first is to examine how ambiguities and dissonant Chinese, Indian and Pakistan approaches to strategic stability affect the prospects that a conflict between them that begins as conventional and limited could escalate into a nuclear exchange. The second task is to consider how to design and implement nuclear risk reduction measures tailored for the strategic context of the triangle China-India-Pakistan. The project started officially on 1 January and is due to end on 30 June 2021.

The first draft of Hiroshima Prefecture research report on assessing the increased salience of nuclear weapons is ready. This report looks at the changes to doctrines and military strategies of Russia, the U.S. and to a lesser extent China. Among others things this report will be presented at a side-event organised by the Hiroshima Prefecture during the 2020 NPT Review Conference in New York taking place in April this year.

The work on the SIPRI Yearbook chapter for nuclear arms controls is moving along and basically finished. Tytti has been working on a paper for the EUNPDC titled '*The arms control-regional security nexus in the Iran nuclear issue*' with a first draft due by 31 January 2020.

- **Fundraising Activities**

In terms of fundraising one being worked on now involves possible collaboration with the Stockholm University for a Swedish MFA proposal on nuclear disarmament non-proliferation education training.

Tytti has been looking at some possibilities for a project proposal to do further work on missile defence. Work has been done in the past but Tytti might with possible collaboration from Vincent look for example at the militarization of space.

- **Travel**

In terms of travels the team have entered information for confirmed trips in the clusterwiki calendar.

Arms and Military Expenditure – report

- **Current Project Activities**

Some key activities includes the processing and production of the arms transfers data for use in both the Yearbook chapter and arms transfers factsheet in preparation for the

updated data launch on 9 March 2020. On the 27 January the AT database is closed and the process of finalising the numbers and assessing the main data findings begins. On Thursday 30 January, SIPRI staff have been invited to the conference room to attend a short presentation on the data from the AMEX team and engage in a discussion about how this may relate to their own work.

Both the arms transfers and milex chapter are being worked on and indeed the milex chapter needs to be drafted by the end of January. Therefore, milex data collection and input activity is well underway. The milex data launch is on the 29 April.

- **Publications**

Recent work concluded and mentioned is the topical backgrounder on Chilean milex data that was released on 16 December 2019: '[Ending off-budget military funding: Lessons from Chile](#)'. A paper on '[Arms Flows to South East Asia](#)' was also published in December. Two other publications forthcoming in early 2020 are a SIPRI paper on Chinese arms industry data due to be published on 27 January and a publication with ODA and military spending data (title TBD) and late February (date to be decided due to sportluv).

- **Travel**

Not much right now but any events are in the clusters-wiki calendar.

- **AOB**

Alexandra's session on '*Roots and Aftermath of Protests in Algeria, Egypt, Iraq, Lebanon*' has been selected for the Peace and Development Forum 2020. The session aims to bring together youth (young professionals) and experts from the MENA region to discuss the issues.

EUNPDC – report

- The EUNPDC conference was held on 13-14 December 2019 and went well. It was a well-attended event even on Saturday and before this event a Next Generation workshop was held on 12 December. This was also well attended and received, and the point is made that it helped to diversify and rejuvenate the participation of the conference. Following the Next Generation workshop, the annual Network Members meetings was held and activities for the year were discussed. The disarmament education meeting and initiative was also discussed and there was much interest in the room on this topic. Moreover, we received the official go ahead from the EEAS to organize one of the formal ad hoc seminars on this topic. The budget is 50,000 euros to do this and it will likely be held in June (week 24 TBC). Participants would include university affiliated members of the European network of NPD think-tanks. The next step will be to reach out more broadly and do something international.
- Follow the conference there was a meeting with the EU funders (with both the EEAS and the EU Commission) and more operational things were discussed and also ideas for the future phase of the consortium.

- A request was made to the EEAS to plan help-desk papers for the year because of previous issues related to late notice and time restrictions. This has previously been promised and this plan is received it will be shared.

- **EUNPDC publications**

- In December 2019, a new EU Non-Proliferation and Disarmament Paper has been published: Verbruggen, M., 'The Question of Swarms Control: Challenges to ensuring human control over military Swarms', EU Non-Proliferation and Disarmament Papers, no. 65, December 2019 (available at: <https://www.nonproliferation.eu/the-question-of-swarms-control-challenges-to-ensuring-human-control-over-military-swarms/>);
- Upcoming papers:
 - (a) Kulesa, L., '*The crisis of nuclear arms control and its impact on European security*' – currently being typeset and checked by author;
 - (b) Bondaz, A., '*From critical engagement to credible commitments: a renewed EU strategy to the North Korean proliferation crisis*' – second round of editing;
 - (c) Erästö, T., '*The arms control-regional security nexus in the Iran nuclear issue*' – first draft due by 31 January 2020;
 - (d) Van der Meer, S., '*The EU and nuclear risk reduction: How to prevent nuclear weapons being used*' – first draft due by 29 February 2020.

- **Open call from Carnegie Corporation New York**

This is not a formal call but the Cluster is encouraged to think about project ideas but just to make sure it is shared with Sibylle before going forward.

- **Grants Management Info - Funding Applications Excel**

The A&D concepts and funding applications Excel sheet is updated and shared and there are no further updates for now. However, the point is made that Lena should have all necessary documentation shared with her to add to the central GAD database.

Lena reminded the Cluster that the UD strategic grant report for 2019 is due shortly. It was a large report to prepare that involves consolidated reports from the Clusters so it is very important we stick to the deadlines as already indicated by Sigrun.

Lena has sent out emails but reminded anybody that has received individual grants from the Swedish MFA are invited to contact Lena if one has questions.

The books for 2019 are being closed and again if anyone has outstanding invoices for 2019 from suppliers they are advised to please chase them down as soon as possible.

Outreach and Publications

- As mentioned earlier the Chinese arms industry data due to be published on 27 January but with press release sent out for embargo on 22 January. There will

also be a Chinese translation of the press release and a lot of media attention is expected.

- It was noted there was a lot of media interest over the recent Holiday period on the Iran issue and Communications were appreciative for flexibility and availability of Pieter Wezeman and Tarja Cronberg for media interviews.
- The SIPRI annual review is in process and updates to the website are continuing. On the issue of our website the question was raised for an opportunity for staff to give more feedback. The specific issue of finding publications or seeing new longer form publications that are essentially hidden was raised. The promotion work towards new publications is very much appreciated but the practicality of finding these publications accessible has not always been easy. There is an awareness of the issue and there is also a website working group and it is suggested a researcher should join. Pieter Wezeman has offered to join if no one else has time.
- The latest member of the Editorial team, Emma Zetterström was introduced to the Cluster.

Conflict, Peace and Security

- The C&P Cluster will be having their first meeting of the year on Friday 17 January, and staff are invited to flag any issues we want to raise. No further issues to report from C&P at the moment and the Stockholm Security Conference will be discussed shortly.

Peace and Development Cluster

- The title for the 2020 Stockholm Forum on Peace and Development is '*The Geopolitics of Peacebuilding*'. Following the format of previous years, the 2020 Stockholm Forum will consist of 'Focus Days' on 11–12 May and an 'Open Day' on 13 May. Participation to the 'Focus Days' is by invitation only.

Sibylle/SMT report -

- **Travel**

Two upcoming trips in February were flagged and one will be a combination of Berlin and Hamburg. Sibylle was invited by the German Ministry of Defence to speak on 'the future of arms control' on 3 February and will use the opportunity to go to the German Foreign Ministry on 4 February and discuss on going funding, both applications and further opportunities. On the 5 February, Sibylle was invited to Hamburg to give a lecture (title is free to choose and TBD but either 'the future of arms control' or something on 'export controls') at the IFSH (Institut für Friedensforschung und Sicherheitspolitik) and also have meetings with them.

On 20-21 of February Sibylle will travel to Vienna and give a lecture at an event organised by the VCDNP (Vienna Centre for Disarmament and Non-Proliferation). They are organising the first EUNPDC proliferation awareness pilot course for natural sciences. VCDNP have made an open call to IT students and engineering students from all over Europe and this will be a three day course on proliferation issues.

Sibylle reported back on a recent trip to Tokyo from the 6-8 December for an international meeting of peace research institutes event titled, '*A Peace Research Agenda for the 21st Century*'. It was interesting and rare opportunity to think about the very fundamental questions one should be thinking about but doesn't find time.

- How do we fit into the field of peace research?
- What are other peace research institutes doing?
- Why are most peace research institutes northern and male dominated?
- What kind of methods are being used?
- What is the future of peace research?
- Where does the field currently stand now?
- Do we apply our own norms and values on our own research?

Sibylle will send around some of the materials from this event and suggests it would be a good idea to take up some of these questions at the away day.

Sibylle reported back on the NPT Review Conference that was held in Wilton Park on 16-18 December in 2019.

Research visit

- Stefan Woll will be on a two week research visit to SIPRI during weeks 4 and 5 and will be accompanied by his daughter Helena who is taking the opportunity to get some work practice here in SIPRI as part of her school curriculum. Stefan is an investigator who works for German customs in the area of export control enforcement and has been a visiting researcher and worked with SIPRI before. Stefan is also the Chair of the Missile Technology Controls Regimes licensing Enforcement Officers Meeting. If you have any questions about how the procurement channel works or missiles proliferation in the Middle East or German enforcement systems then take the opportunity to meet with Stefan while here.

SMT

- On the suggestion of the GB the SMT had a discussion on indicators for measuring progress for the implementation of the SIPRI strategy and this is something we should take up at our away day. The five year strategy is now up on the intranet and includes also a strategy for our cluster. The options is SMT came up with can be shared at our next Cluster meeting and at the away day the Cluster can have a slot to discuss and see if it works for us. How can indicators apply to their own Programme and their own work?

- In terms of projects there will be new guidance on how to do the application process with a timeline. In addition, Sigrun would like to be kept up to date on the state of implementation for all externally funded projects. A traffic light system has been suggested by Dan;
 1. Green is everything is on track.
 2. Yellow – there is an issue but it's being addressed.
 3. Red – there is an issue and this needs to be fixed.
 4. Highlight - when we have a huge launch event coming up.

It is suggested there are tools to automate this type of project monitoring system with the following apps named such as Trello.com, Monday.com or Asana.com. As Sibylle will need to communicate to Sigrun she has requested from each Programme Director or Project Lead a signaling on the progress of projects they are responsible for. Sibylle is happy to have one on one meetings with project managers to discuss project progress and get reports.

Annual MFA NIS Visit

- On 21 January a delegation from NIS/UD will visit SIPRI for a three hour meeting including lunch. Dan will do the welcome, NIS will give an overview of priorities and Sibylle will give a broad overview of the work happening within the A&D Cluster for the next year. Representatives from the Cluster will also give brief presentations on the main work priorities. As Ian Anthony and Vincent cannot make this meeting, Sibylle will give a brief overview of current chemical project work and the work from the emerging technologies project. Giovanna and Kolja will present from the DUAT Programme, Shannon from the NDACNP Programme and Nan and Diego from AMEX. Sibylle requests from those speaking to please send some bullet points to her in advance.

Stockholm Security Conference

- The A&D and C&P Clusters will organise the SSC 2020 together by building on our strength and convening power and our ability to bring together global perspectives. There is a request to have this year's SSC back to back with the Governing Board meeting so the GB members will be available as speakers. The GB meeting is scheduled for the 16-17 November and this is two weeks after the US elections. The framing of the conference will be based around the working title 'The future of multilateralism' and how it impacts on the different issues we work with. This would allow us to address some of the big questions and draw on GB expertise covering a broad range of issues. How this plays out for the more technical discussions around subjects such as autonomous weapons and LAWS, cyber issues and everything we work on could be addressed. The introductory and concluding session could be very broad but still allow us come up with specific sessions within our area of expertise. We have some money left over from the SSC last year so doing it back to back with the GB meeting allows us save even more financially. Breakout session are now up to staff from both Clusters to suggest. Linked to this is the idea that in 2021 we will do something very much framed around the issues in the A&D Cluster, perhaps something

along the lines of technology governance and we have time to go out and fund raise.

The issue of title was raised as there are a lot of events with the same title but this is a work in progress and suggestions are welcome. Meanwhile the topic will allow us to address big geo-political questions and post US elections.

A request for direction from the DoS's is requested – perhaps just a couple of pages mentioning what the conference is trying to address? Unpack in a systematic way what we are trying to achieve with the Conference in terms of content? How the research strategy and cluster strategy tie in? This will help us to think strategically of what could be our suggestions from the various projects. This would be a nice way to structure the discussion – how you see this topic and what you think is really interesting and timely with the topic? What we should think of when we try to design the topic? Do we see this as an opportunity for fund raising or more a case of show casing what we really do?

SIPRI Travel Policy

- Staff are reminded to comply with the travel policy that all staff have been made aware of and should have read.

2020 Away Day

- The A&D away-day will be held on Wednesday 4 March, and hosted in the van der Nootska Palace, at Sankt Paulsgatan 21 in Södermalm, Stockholm, Sweden. More details will come once the agenda is prepared and sent around.

Cluster-wiki 2020

http://clusterswiki.sipri.org/index.php/Main_Page

- A new Cluster calendar-wiki for 2020 has been created - the Cluster is reminded to start entering information for already scheduled upcoming meeting events in 2020.

AOB

Next cluster meeting

- 19 February at 1:30PM in the Conference Room. (changed to lunch room)